

NOKUTS tilsynsrapporter

# Marketing Management

PhD programme at Buskerud University College

December 2013



Institution:	Buskerud University College
Name of educational provision:	Marketing Management
Degree/Studiepoeng (ECTS):	PhD programme. 180 studiepoeng/ECTS
Date of decision:	December 12th, 2013
Expert Committee:	Professor Emeritus Kjell Grønhaug, Norwegian School of Economics, (NHH) Professor Niina Nummela, Turku School of Economics Professor Terje I. Våland, University of Stavanger PhD Candidate Jakob Utgård, Norwegian Business School (BI)
Case Officer:	Adviser Ingvild Andersen
Archive Number:	13/383

## Introduction

The external quality assurance performed by NOKUT consists of evaluating the institution's quality assurance systems, accreditation of new provisions and revision of accredited provisions. Universities and university colleges have different self-accrediting powers. For an institution without self-accrediting powers to establish a provision in a certain cycle an application must be made to NOKUT.

Hereby NOKUT presents the accreditation report of PhD programme in Marketing Management at Buskerud University College. The expert evaluation in this report is part of the accreditation process following Buskerud University College's application for accreditation submitted before the application deadline on May 1<sup>st</sup>, 2013. This report clearly indicates the extensive evaluation performed to ensure the educational quality of the planned educational provision.

NOKUT's conclusion is that Marketing Management at Buskerud University College fulfils NOKUT's conditions for accreditation and is therefore accredited.

This decision does not have limited validity in time. NOKUT will however make a subsequent supervision of the educational provision within three years.

Oslo, December 12<sup>th</sup>, 2013.



Terje Mørland  
Director General

Information on accreditation of educational provisions (in Norwegian):  
[www.nokut.no/sokjeakkreditering](http://www.nokut.no/sokjeakkreditering)

**Contents**

**1 Information regarding the applicant institution and the application ..... 1**

**2 Description of procedure ..... 3**

**3 Administrative assessment ..... 4**

**4 Expert assessment ..... 5**

    4.1 Basic conditions for accreditation ..... 6

    4.2 Study Plan..... 9

    4.3 Discipline community/-ies attached to the provision ..... 15

    4.4 Support functions and infrastructure ..... 18

**5 Conclusion ..... 20**

**6 Commentary from the institution..... 22**

**7 The expert committee’s additional evaluation ..... 27**

**8 Final conclusion..... 28**

**9 Decision ..... 29**

**10 Presentation of the expert committee ..... 30**

**11 Documentation..... 31**

## 1 Information regarding the applicant institution and the application

Buskerud University College (BUC) was established in August 1994 as the result of the reform of the higher education sector in Norway. Three former university colleges in Hønefoss, Kongsberg and Drammen were merged and became Buskerud University College. At present, BUC is in the process of merging with Vestfold University College, which will be accomplished in 2014.

BUC has approximately 279 employees and 4,000 students on three campuses: Ringerike/Hønefoss (1,300 students), Kongsberg (1,400 students) and Drammen (1,300 students). The institution consists of four faculties: School of Business and Social Sciences, Faculty of Health Sciences, Faculty of Teacher Education and Faculty of Technology. They offer studies in areas such as nursing, radiography, visual communication, teacher education, lighting design, political science, business administration, tourism, IT, law, engineering and optometry.

As a university college, Buskerud University College cannot itself accredit new educational provisions in the second and third cycle (master and PhD). The following educational provisions at the institution have obtained accreditation from NOKUT:

- Systems Engineering med Embedded systems (120 studiepoeng/ECTS), master, 2010
- Klinisk helsearbeid - tjenesteutvikling innen medisinsk strålebruk (120 studiepoeng/ECTS), master, 2010
- Menneskerettigheter og multikulturalisme (120 studiepoeng/ECTS), master, 2009
- Systems Engineering (120 studiepoeng/ECTS), master, 2009
- Datateknikk (Advanced Computing Technologies and Systems, 120 studiepoeng/ECTS), master, joint degree, 2006
- Optometri og synsvitenskap (120 studiepoeng/ECTS), master, 2006
- Helserettet katastrofehåndtering (120 studiepoeng/ECTS), master, 2005
- Klinisk helsearbeid (120 studiepoeng/ECTS), master, 2004
- Utdanningsledelse (90 studiepoeng ECTS), master, 2004

BUC obtained accreditation of a master programme in economics and administration (økonomi og administrasjon) from the Ministry of Education and Research prior to the establishment of NOKUT.

The institution's quality assurance system was evaluated and approved in 2008.

BUC applied for accreditation of a doctoral programme in marketing management (180 studiepoeng/ECTS) by the application deadline of May 1<sup>st</sup>, 2013.

### **The University College's description of the programme and the applicant's grounds for the application**

The School of Business and Social Sciences at Buskerud University College (BUC) seeks to offer a PhD program in marketing management, which is a well-defined field within business and administration theory and practice. Marketing management is an organizational function and a set of processes for creating, communicating, and delivering value to customers and for managing customer

relationships to benefit the organization and its stakeholders (Kotler and Keller 2009, p. 305). Marketing management also is an interdisciplinary academic field, building on economics, psychology, sociology, and philosophy (Hunt 1991). The focus in the program is to explore and study marketing management as an interdisciplinary and comprehensive practice and research area.

The PhD program seeks to bring academic research in marketing management closer to marketing management practice, thereby focusing research on topics that will generate new knowledge for real world problems. A critique of many PhD programs in marketing management is that too much research is irrelevant for practice, which marginalizes the field. BUC's PhD program in marketing management meets this challenge with a program that develops knowledge to improve marketing management in both private companies and public services. As markets and technologies become more global, as customer needs become more advanced and fragmented, private companies and public services must innovate and improve their products and services at an increasing speed. To cope with these challenges and opportunities, competence in marketing management is strategically more important (ISBM 2012). BUC aims to offer a high-quality PhD in marketing Management of high quality that will meet the present and future needs of knowledge in marketing management, both nationally and internationally.

There is a national need for more doctorates in marketing management. About 40.000 of the 230.000 students are pursuing a degree in business and administration, and Statistisk Sentralbyrå (Statistics Norway) expects those numbers to remain at that level or increase slightly in the next 10 years. Although business study programs account for approximately 17 percent of the total number of students, the number of doctoral degrees in business subjects (with marketing as only one of several areas) is only about 2 percent. Based on the need for all study programs to secure and provide scientific quality through research-active faculties with doctoral degrees, a huge need exists to increase the number of doctoral degrees in all business subjects, including marketing management. The BUC School of Business and Social Sciences is the third largest in Norway in number of students (2,500 students), after Norwegian Business School (BI) (15,000) and Norwegian School of Economics (NHH) (3,000 students). In 2011, BI and NHH graduated 12 and 15 doctorates respectively, with only five in marketing management. Thus, BUC's PhD program in marketing management will make an important contribution to filling the gap in research faculty in higher education in Norway.

BUC describes in their application that the faculty at BUC's School of Business and Social Sciences is a strong and competent group of international-oriented researchers in marketing management. The group also is well connected with the business community, which offers assurance that doctoral candidates will develop not only a strong command of theories and research methodologies, but also new knowledge and practice relevant for private companies and public services. Building a closer link between academia and business practice is an overall goal and ambition for BUC and the School of Business and Social Sciences.

## 2 Description of procedure

NOKUT makes an administrative assessment to ensure that all basic conditions for accreditation are fulfilled as expressed in the Regulation concerning NOKUT's supervision and control of the quality in Norwegian higher education (hereafter referred to as the Quality Assurance Regulation on Higher Education.). For applications that have been approved administratively, NOKUT appoints external experts for the evaluation of the application. The external experts have declared that they are legally competent to perform an independent evaluation, and carry out their assignment in accordance with the mandate for expert assessment passed by NOKUT's board, and in accordance with the requirements for educational quality as determined by the Quality Assurance Regulation on Higher Education.

The expert assessment includes a visit to the institution where the following groups are interviewed: the management of the university college, master students, PhD candidates, academic management, the discipline community, administrative management and possibly employers. In addition, the committee inspects the university college's infrastructure. Based on both the written documentation and information from the interviews, the expert committee shall conclude either with a yes or no as to whether the quality of the educational provision complies with the requirements in the Quality Assurance Regulation on Higher Education. NOKUT also requests that the expert committee advise on further improvements of the educational provision. All criteria must be satisfactorily met before NOKUT accredits an educational provision.

The expert committee's report is sent to the applicant institution, which is then given three weeks to comment. Thereafter NOKUT decides whether the comments should be sent to the committee for additional consideration. If so, the committee submits a revised assessment. NOKUT's board then reaches a final decision about accreditation.

The current report presents the accreditation process chronologically. As described above, the committee is free to change its conclusion on accreditation in the course of the process, and has in fact done so in this report. The final conclusion is found in part 8.

The application was written in English and the expert committee chose English as their working language both for the written assessments and the site visit. However, Buskerud University College submitted their commentary to the expert assessment in Norwegian, and this is cited in Norwegian in part 6 below. As NOKUT is a Norwegian administrative agency, the official decision is written in Norwegian (part 9).

### 3 Administrative assessment

#### Quality Assurance Regulation on Higher Education § 4-1: Basic conditions for accreditation

1. Demands expressed in the Universities and Colleges Act concerning the following arrangements will be assessed:
  - a. Internal regulations and governance
  - b. Appeals Committee
  - c. Learning Environment Committee
  - d. Educational Plan
  - e. Diplomas and Diploma Supplement
  - f. Quality assurance system

#### NOKUT's assessment

The intention of this article is to make it clear and predictable what regulations in the University and Colleges Act (2002) that NOKUT supervises. Buskerud University College (BUC) offers accredited educational provision. Hence, it is presupposed that the demands expressed in the Universities and Colleges Act are fulfilled. Diploma supplement is evaluated as satisfactory. NOKUT has deemed the application to be satisfactory for expert assessment. The educational provision's PhD regulations and other regulations will be assessed by the expert committee.

As expressed to BUC, NOKUT has assessed the original version of the Regulation for the Degree of Philosophiae doctor (PhD) at Buskerud University published in Lovdata, and not the English translation which was submitted as part of the application. NOKUT has the following remarks to the regulations for the degree of Philosophiae Doctor (PhD) at Buskerud University College, and advises that BUC changes their regulations accordingly.

- § 6-2. There is nothing in the regulations about forced termination if academic misconduct is discovered.

- § 8-1 and § 8-3. BUC demands that complaints must be substantiated. There is no such demand in the Public Administration Act, and BUC cannot refuse to handle complaints that are not substantiated. On the other hand, they are entitled to recommend that a complaint is substantiated.

Since Buskerud University College does not yet have accreditation for educational provisions in the third cycle, their system for quality assurance of the provision in regard to the PhD level, should therefore normally have been assessed as part of this process. However, as Buskerud University College currently are involved in a project with NOKUT regarding the quality assurance system that is under development as part of the merger between Buskerud University College and Vestfold University College<sup>1</sup>, the quality assurance system is not evaluated as part of this process. Vestfold University College has PhD programmes which are accredited by NOKUT.

---

<sup>1</sup> The institutions have been exempted from the normal cycle of evaluation by the Ministry of Education and Research in order to be part of NOKUT's project.



## 4 Expert assessment <sup>2</sup>

This chapter is the expert committee's assessment. The term "we" refers to the expert committee as such. The number preceding each heading refers to the corresponding provision in the Quality Assurance Regulation on Higher Education.

### Summary of the report

The evaluation is based on the application; a detailed description of the PhD programme and additional materials requested by the committee. In addition, we have conducted a two-days visit to the institution, allowing us to discuss all aspects of the application. The site-visit allowed for clarification of some of the committee's questions, as well for access to information supplementing our basis for the evaluation.

In spite of a well-written application and extensive description of the programme – and also that many of the requirements are met, the committee cannot recommend accreditation. This conclusion is agreed upon by the whole committee.

Below we briefly describe strengths and weaknesses of the application, and also why we have arrived at the conclusion that our recommendation is not to accredit the applied for programme.

The committee finds that the estimates of recruitment are relevant to the establishing of a satisfactory learning environment and stable provision. The institution is, however, urged to work actively with the recruitments including developing a "marketing plan" to succeed in this respect. Further, the committee found the institution's documentation satisfactory as well as the title for the provision as satisfactory.

With regard to learning outcomes the committee found most of them well aligned with the programme. However, the committee observed that for some of the knowledge-related learning outcomes the wording resembles more level 7 (master level) than the required level 8 learning outcomes including the achievement of high international standard. The committee found that the provision is relevant for working life and/or continued studies.

Content and design of the provision was partly found satisfactorily related to the intended learning outcomes, however, with one exception. According to the committee the institution is required to revise the study plan so that it includes obligatory courses both in quantitative and qualitative research methods.

Further, the teaching and students' work were found suited for the achievements of intended learning outcomes, as expressed in the study programme. However, the university college is advised to make sure that the method courses include exercise-based learning. The committee also found suggested exams and other means of evaluation suited for the assessment of the students' attainment of the learning outcomes. With regard to the dissertation, the university college is advised to require that the candidate is the sole author of at least one article if the dissertation is based on a collection of articles, as well as to include requirements regarding authorship in the supplement to the PhD regulation.

---

<sup>2</sup> The current report presents the accreditation process chronologically. As described above, the committee is free to change its conclusion on accreditation in the course of the process, and has in fact done so in this report. The final conclusion is found in part 8.

The committee also observed that the provision has adequate systems for student exchange and international arrangements adapted to its level, volume and other characteristics.

It was also found that the discipline community attached to the provision is satisfactory. However, the institution is advised to secure that the core group of marketing professors does not become smaller, draft a recruitment plan to make the programme less vulnerable, consider recruiting more staff with competence in qualitative methods, as well as include the extended group as much as possible in the PhD programme.

It was further found that at least 50 per cent of the academic FTEs allotted to the provision are members of the institution's own academic staff, and that professors are represented among those who will teach the core elements of the provision.

The committee also found the discipline community active in research satisfactory for the fulfillments of the criteria and demands specific to the cycle of the present educational provision. The discipline community was also found to participate actively in national and international networks and collaborative arrangements/projects. Finally the institution has adequate support functions and infrastructure.

Above we have summarized the central points from our evaluations. Most requirements are met. In addition to considerations for improvements it is required that:

- The institution must revise the study plan to include compulsory courses in both quantitative and qualitative research methods.
- The institution must revise the knowledge related learning outcomes so they better match the level 8 in the Norwegian Qualification Framework.

## ***4.1 Basic conditions for accreditation***

### **4.1.1 Demands expressed in the Universities and Colleges Act.**

These demands have been evaluated by NOKUT in the administrative assessment.

### **4.1.2 Demands expressed in national curriculum frameworks, where such apply, and in relevant Regulations issued by the Ministry of Education and Research must be met.**

#### **Assessment**

The Ministry of Education and Research's regulations on quality assurance and quality development in higher education and vocational education<sup>3</sup> requires that there is a professional working environment. This refers, e.g., to sufficient human resources needed for the implementation of the programme. The minimum requirement is the workload of eight full-time persons annually and four of these must hold the qualifications of a full professor. Additionally, the applying institution needs to

---

<sup>3</sup> [Forskrift om kvalitetssikring og kvalitetsutvikling i høyere utdanning og fagskoleutdanning.](#)

demonstrate their capability of including at least 15 PhD students in the programme within five years of initiation.

In their application Buskerud University College (BUC) states that the faculty includes 21 members. Eight of these members are full-time faculty of BUC and two employed at Vestfold University College (VUC), which will be merged with BUC on January 1, 2014. The remaining faculty members are employed at other Norwegian and international universities, but they also hold permanent part-time positions at BUC (professor II). Among the 21 faculty members, 15 are full professors and six are associate professors. Hence, BUC has the sufficient number of full-time persons and the correct formal competence as required in the regulations.

By now BUC has 34 Ph.D. candidates, six of them attached to the School of Business and Social Sciences, but only a few of them in marketing. However, based on a four year PhD programme (with a 25 per cent mandatory work load, economic support, as well as active recruitment) the committee finds it likely that BUC will be able to recruit five new PhD students every year and thus reach the aim for programme size, i.e. 15-20 students.

The human resources attached to the programme are adequate and the aim for 15 to 20 PhD students in the programme seems realistic. However, the recruitment of the candidates poses some challenges which are further discussed in point 4.1.3.

#### Conclusion

Yes, the condition is fulfilled.

#### **4.1.3 Estimates of student recruitment, as relevant in relation to the establishing of a satisfactory learning environment and stable provision, must be presented.**

##### Assessment

In the application BUC states that they have a good basis for student recruitment, both internally from their own master programmes as well as from the region. Although the committee agrees that an institution with long tradition of training master students (such as BUC) does have an advantage in recruiting students internally, we do not share the optimism of the applicant in full. In our opinion, the recruitment and the process related to it may form a bottleneck for a successful programme if not planned carefully – for multiple reasons.

First, traditionally students in business administration and in particular in marketing have preferred a business career to an academic one. Motivating the very best students to a position with interesting tasks, but a considerably lower salary level may prove to be very difficult. Second, the very well-established institutions in larger Norwegian cities (NHH or BI, for example) have experienced similar challenges. Therefore, we support the ideas of BUC in extending the recruitment efforts to a broader audience within Norway. This is preferable also in order to secure a high quality of PhD candidates.

Furthermore, in the application BUC states that they will recruit candidates from other business schools in Sweden and Denmark. Additionally, at the campus interviews they mentioned other alternatives, such as targeted recruitment from the international partner universities and from the

industry. The committee welcomes these plans, as they seem more feasible than a completely open international recruitment. The benefits from the latter need to be carefully considered in the light of drawbacks, such as heavy administrative process needed both for application and appeal of potential PhD candidates.

However, the committee agrees that the number of applicants for a PhD in marketing management can be expanded by an active and goal-directed recruitment, given sufficient number of financed study positions and attractive study programme.

#### Conclusion

Yes, the condition is fulfilled.

The university college is advised to:

- Actively encourage recruitment also from outside the home institutions (Buskerud University College and Vestfold University College).
- Develop a “marketing” plan for active recruitment.

#### **4.1.4 A plan of the students’ expected workload must be presented.**

This does not apply for the third cycle.

#### **4.1.5 When part(s) of the provision is taught outside the degree awarding institution formally agreed documents must be in place to regulate issues of importance for the students.**

##### Assessment

In the application BUC states that no part of the PhD programme requires the participation of an external partner or institution, so this should not be relevant. However, BUC is a member of the National Research School in Business Administration (Nasjonal forskerskole for bedriftsøkonomi) and PhD students may take course provided by the Research School. The consortium agreement between the parties is included in the application.

When it comes to PhD students who have their place of work at another institution than BUC, important regulations are described in the ‘Agreement concerning the admission to the study program for Philosphiae Doctor (PhD) Part C’ (attached to the application).

#### Conclusion

Yes, the institution’s presented documentation is satisfactory.

## 4.2 Study Plan

1. The educational provision must have an adequate title
2. The provision must be described with reference to learning outcomes
  - a) Learning outcomes must be expressed in terms of a candidate's intended achievements in knowledge, skills and general competence, as related to the National Qualifications Frameworks.
  - b) The provision's relevance for working life and/or continued studies must be clearly expressed.
  - c) Content and design of the provision must be satisfactorily related to the description of learning outcomes.
  - d) Teaching and student work must be suited for the achievement of intended learning outcomes, as expressed in the plan.
  - e) Exams and other means of evaluation must be suited for the assessment of the students' attainment of intended learning outcomes, as expressed in the plan.
3. The provision must have satisfactory links to research and academic and/or artistic development work, adapted to its level, volume and other characteristics.
4. The provision must be attached to student exchange and internationalization arrangements adapted to its level, volume and other characteristics.

### 4.2.1 The educational provision must have an adequate title

#### Assessment

The PhD programme is titled 'PhD in Marketing Management'. The applicant believes that this reflects the programme content and purpose as well as the competence of the faculty. Marketing management is today defined as an organizational function and a set of processes for creating, communicating, and delivering value to customers and for managing customer relationships to benefit the organization and its stakeholders. Also marketing is a broad field drawing on several disciplines such as economics, psychology, organization and more.

The term "management" also indicates that marketing is a management task of key concern for the organization. A key characteristic of BUC's programme is that it is kept closer to real life marketing problems and management practice than other marketing programmes offered in this country (as well as most programmes offered abroad). It should also be noted, that even the term "marketing management" is broad (and often left undefined) the concept has been used for multiple decades and the term seems rather well understood.

#### Conclusion

Yes, the title of the provision is adequate.

### 4.2.2 The provision must be described with reference to learning outcomes

#### **a. Learning outcomes must be expressed in terms of a candidate's intended achievements in knowledge, skills and general competence, as related to the National Qualifications Framework.**

The application describes the expected learning outcomes according to the Norwegian Qualifications Framework in terms of knowledge, skills and general competence. After completing the programme the candidate is expected to have obtained the following (as presented in the application):

#### Knowledge:

- in-depth knowledge of theories, methods, and specific issues pertaining to marketing management
- in-depth knowledge of on-going research in the forefront of theory development in marketing management
- advanced knowledge of the philosophy of science and relevant ethical issues relating to marketing management research

#### Skills:

- ability to contribute to the development of new scientific knowledge, theories and method within marketing management, to challenge existing interpretations and to use new forms of documentation to disseminate knowledge within marketing management
- ability to formulate research problems and research designs relevant to marketing management and carry out research at a high international academic level
- ability to evaluate the applicability of various research designs, methods and data analyses specific to marketing management
- ability to relate theories in marketing management to real-world marketing management issues and apply research-based knowledge to challenge established practice in relevant organisations and businesses
- ability to evaluate the quality of others' research in marketing management

#### General competence:

- ability to participate in academic discussions and communicate research work through recognised national and international academic channels in marketing management
- ability to contribute to innovation through dissemination and application of theories in marketing management to a broader audience outside academia, thereby enhancing knowledge and improving practice in marketing management
- ability to identify relevant ethical issues in marketing management and work with the necessary professional integrity both inside and outside the academic field of marketing management
- development of transferable skills to manage complex projects fitted for assignments both in research and the practice field of marketing management

#### Assessment

These learning outcomes seem well aligned with the programme theme both with regard to knowledge, skills and general competence. For most part they follow the level 8 in Norwegian Qualifications Framework (PhD). However, the committee would like to point out that in terms of knowledge-related learning outcomes the wording resembles more level 7 (master level) and therefore these learning outcomes must be revised before initiation of the programme. Furthermore, it should be noticed that on level 8 the learning outcomes should stress the achievement of high international standard, which could be better reflected in the intended learning outcomes of the programme.

#### Conclusion

No, learning outcomes are not satisfactorily described.

- The institution must revise the knowledge-related learning outcomes so that they match better the level 8 in the Norwegian Qualifications Framework.

**b. The provision's relevance for working life and/or continued studies must be clearly expressed.**

**Assessment**

In the application BUC highlights the importance and relevance of marketing management as a research topic. We do agree with the applicant that this is not only a core area of research within business studies, but it is also of utmost importance for the successful operations of companies from small, open economies such as Norway. The scope of the programme is kept broad on purpose, not at least because of the expected close collaboration with industry. This approach is welcomed by the committee, as it allows the research topics to emerge more freely taking into account not only the interest of the doctoral candidates and recent theoretical development, but also the needs of business in practice.

Although the application does not provide a very detailed description of the relevance, BUC demonstrated during the site visit organization, collaboration and research issues involving actors from the tourism industry, which can to a substantial degree influence the industry' and firms' competitiveness. This large-scaled project is funded by Norwegian Research Council and REISEPOL, and obtained in competition among research institutions in Norway. BUC is also working for developing similar cooperation and programmes with actors in other industries.

**Conclusion**

Yes, the provision's relevance for working life and/or continued studies is clearly expressed.

**c. Content and design of the provision must be satisfactorily related to the description of learning outcomes.**

**Assessment**

The application provides a detailed description of the study plan, the planned courses and a table which connects the intended learning outcomes and course (Table 4). The courses and their intended learning outcomes are of great importance for the most demanding part of a PhD programme – the dissertation. The courses, closeness and access to supporting supervisions should contribute to success in the demanding dissertation phase of the PhD programme in marketing.

In general, the committee feels that the study plan is well related to the intended learning outcomes and it is probable that after completing the programme the candidate will have the expected qualifications. However, there is one significant exception of the rule, and in this area the committee feels that the applicant falls short in meeting the learning outcomes. This area is research methods.

In terms of skills, BUC proposes two clearly methods-related learning outcomes:

- ability to formulate research problems and designs relevant to marketing management and carry out research at a high international academic level
- ability to evaluate the applicability of various research designs, methods and data analyses specific to marketing management

Achieving these learning outcomes would require that the PhD candidates are exposed to diverse research methodologies and learn about their appropriate use. Which methods and techniques most suitable for formulating and design a research programme, should therefore be significantly influenced by the research problem. At the moment the study plan includes courses both on quantitative and qualitative research methods, but the curriculum is heavily biased towards quantitative methods. Furthermore, the only course on qualitative methods is an elective one, which means that it is possible to complete a PhD with very limited knowledge and skills on these methods. The committee thinks that this is a significant weakness in otherwise well-balanced study plan and should be corrected.

#### Conclusion

No, the provision's content and design is not satisfactorily related to the description of learning outcomes.

- The institution is required to revise the study plan so that it includes compulsory courses both in quantitative and qualitative research methods.

#### **d. Teaching and student work must be suited for the achievement of intended learning outcomes, as expressed in the plan.**

##### Assessment

The PhD programme at BUC is a combination of lectures, seminars and term paper presentations as well as independent research. This combination of activities including exposure to advanced theories and networks, concentrated work and pressure to present is highly adequate to reach the intended learning outcomes.

During the programme the students (candidates) will be urged to present and discuss their research including research papers, and proposals, and will also be invited to seminars with recognized researchers to present and discuss their research. Such activities are highly relevant for the work with the PhD dissertation (which must be evaluated of an independent committee and be accepted before it can be defended).

In terms of coursework the contact hours are heavily biased towards seminars, which is an appropriate method with advanced students and small groups, such as a PhD programme. The reading packages for courses contain relevant literature and are on the level which is expected of PhD candidates. Although the application is somewhat unclear on the method courses, the committee expects that BUC follows the commonly used, exercise-based learning on those courses.

#### Conclusion

Yes, the teaching and student work is suited for the achievement of intended learning outcomes, as expressed in the plan.

- The university college is advised to make sure that the method courses include exercise-based learning on those courses.



**e. Exams and other means of evaluation must be suited for the assessment of the students' attainment of intended learning outcomes, as expressed in the plan.**

**Assessment**

In the PhD programme, a term paper is the main form of assessment. Although the committee agrees that it is the most appropriate method of assessment on PhD level, we argue that a more diverse method of assessment should be considered. Furthermore, we recommend that BUC would reconsider whether all term papers should be assessed with the scale pass/fail. Given that the PhD candidates often use the term papers as pieces of their own research, it would be very valuable and motivating for them to receive more detailed feedback on the papers.

Additionally, the committee was particularly concerned with how BUC would monitor the progress of PhD candidates, as non-performing students are a common problem in all higher education institutions. The plan of making the candidates write three term papers within the first six months of study (evaluated by three different professors) seems as a good idea.

The dissertation can either be a monograph or a collection of 3-5 publishable articles. The dissertation will be evaluated by a committee of three, of whom maximum one is affiliated to BUC. The supervisor(s) cannot be part of the committee. The outlined process of submitting and evaluating the dissertation resembles established standards at other institutions and is adequate for assessing the candidate's work.

The requirements for the contents of monographs or article-based dissertations are clear. It is positive that articles co-authored with others can form part of the dissertation, and that the candidate is required to be first or sole author on at least two articles (although this is only stated in the application and not in the supplements to the regulation or the course description). However, the committee believes that the candidate should be sole author on at least one article to show that she or he can do independent, high-quality research.

**Conclusion**

Yes, exams and other means of evaluation are suited for the assessment of the students' attainment of intended learning outcomes, as expressed in the plan.

The university college is advised to:

- Consider including other modes of assessment as well as a revision of the assessment scale.
- Require that the candidate is sole author on at least one article if the dissertation is article-based, and to include requirements regarding authorship in the supplements to the PhD regulations.

**4.2.3 The provision must have satisfactory links to research and academic and/or artistic development work, adapted to its level, volume and other characteristics.**

**Assessment**

In the application BUC expresses its intent to link the PhD programme in marketing management with its on-going research projects. One of the research projects – Developing Sources of Competitive Advantage in the Norwegian Travel Industry – was also presented to the committee during the site visit. This extensive five year project is a good example of a project which is relevant from the

viewpoint of the programme. It may act both as a basis for relevant research questions, source of data and potential for research funding.

The committee hopes that the BUC faculty is able to introduce also other similar research projects as they would certainly be of value to the programme. In order to not limit the academic freedom of the PhD candidates of the programme – also other research topics than the ones linked to these projects should be acceptable. This, however, will require efforts to clarify whether the faculty possesses the needed competence, willingness and has the time to become involved.

#### Conclusion

Yes, the provision has satisfactory links to research and academic and/or artistic development work, adapted to its level, volume and other characteristics.

- The university college is advised to continue including PhD candidates in research projects.

#### **4.2.4 The provision must be attached to student exchange and internationalization arrangements adapted to its level, volume and other characteristics.**

##### Assessment

According to the application, BUC has chosen internationalization as one of its strategic priorities. This is also reflected well in the PhD programme by its international orientation and close cooperation with professors from abroad, as well as the requirement that all PhD candidates who are accepted in the programme should spend at least one semester abroad, where BUC will assist with application, advice and additional grants. The committee welcomes this initiative and stresses the importance of a lengthier stay at a foreign educational institution.

BUC has long term collaboration particularly with North American universities and it can be expected that at least in the beginning, the international visits will be focusing on the partner universities. This is understandable as many of the PhD candidates will have a second supervisor based in these institutions and thus they will receive substantial benefit of their stay abroad.

PhD candidates are expected to apply for external funding for their stay abroad, but in case this does not succeed, BUC will support the candidate financially through its strategic funds. Besides funding, the PhD candidates will also receive additional support from administration and international office where they have prior experience in supporting international mobility of master students and staff. In case the programme will be opened to international recruitment, additional resources will probably be needed to support the internationalization at home.

#### Conclusion

Yes, the provision has systems for student exchange and internationalization arrangements adapted to its level, volume and other characteristics.

### **4.3 Discipline community/-ies attached to the provision**

#### **4.3.1 The composition, size and collective competence of the relevant discipline community/-ies must be adapted to the provision as the plan describes it and adequate for the conduct of relevant research and development work.**

##### Assessment

The discipline community attached to the programme consists of a core group of eight faculty members with full-time positions at the BUC, and 13 faculty members in an extended group who hold adjunct positions. The core group are responsible for and will generally teach the courses in the program as well as working as supervisors, while the extended group will teach parts of courses and supervise students. In total, 9.35 FTE are allocated to the programme. 5.9 FTE (63%) are from the core group of BUC full-time staff. All the faculty members in the core group have full-time employment at BUC. Of the 21 persons attached to the programme, 15 are professors and six associate professors. In the core group, six of eight are professors and the two remaining associate professors. In total, this satisfies the regulation's requirement<sup>4</sup> that new PhD programmes have a "discipline community equivalent of eight FTE at the professor or associate professor level, of which six is in full-time combined research- and teaching positions and at least four at the professor level" (the committee's translation). Together the core group and the extended group have sufficient competence to supervise the PhD students in their dissertation work.

The composition of the discipline community is overall adequate, although with some relatively thinly covered areas, this also include the managerial aspects and problems focussed in PhD programme in Marketing Management. The field of marketing research has three main areas: consumer behaviour, marketing strategy and modelling. The discipline community attached to the programme are working within consumer behaviour and marketing strategy, and in these fields it has the necessary competence and size, in particular when one takes into account the extended group. The committee understands that a small institution cannot have competence in all fields, but notes that one area which is important for marketing management, namely modelling (i.e. mathematical modelling of marketing problems) is not represented. If BUC will aim at modelling, personell with this competence will be needed. It should, however, be noted that leading institutions in Norway, e.g. NHH, do not have any specialist nor offers any course in (mathematical) modelling in marketing.

The committee has some concerns regarding the size of the core group which will be the base for the programme. Of the core faculty with full-time positions, there are six professors and two associate professors. Of the six professors, only three have the majority of their publications within the field of marketing. The small size of the core faculty is somewhat compensated for by the strong list of adjunct faculty – should one of the core faculty leave, for instance, one of the adjunct professors can take over teaching and supervision. Still, the committee thinks that the university college has a minimum level of core marketing professors, and that BUC cannot let this group become smaller.

One particular area of concern is qualitative methods. If qualitative methods becomes a compulsory course – as suggested by the committee – and students using qualitative methods in their research are recruited, the programme may need more competence in this field in the future. At present, however, this is not a problem.

---

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.lovddata.no/for/sf/kd/td-20100201-0096-003.html>

The strength of the discipline community is in many ways the extended group, which include several highly productive, much cited and well-known scholars in Norway and abroad. The extended group also includes several Norwegian professors either working in or with close relations to industry. The committee believes that BUC can produce a successful PhD programme if they manage to combine the networks and high competence of the international staff with the access to interesting problems and data and active supervision from the local faculty.

#### Conclusion

Yes, the composition, size and collective competence of the discipline community/-ies is adapted to the provision as the plan describes it, and is adequate for the conduct of relevant research and development work.

The institution is advised to:

- Not let the core group of marketing professors become smaller.
- Consider drafting a recruitment plan for the discipline community in order to make the programme less vulnerable.
- Consider recruiting more staff with competence in qualitative methods.
- Include the extended group as much as possible in the PhD programme, for instance in the annual seminar of PhD students.

#### **4.3.2 At least 50 per cent of the academic FTEs allotted to the provision must be members of the institution's own academic staff. Of these, professors (full or associate) must be represented among those who teach the core elements of the provision.**

c. For third cycle provisions, PhD or stipend programme for artistic development work, at least 50 per cent of the relevant discipline community/-ies must be full professors, and the rest associate professors.

#### Assessment

BUC has documented a total of 9.35 FTE allotted to the programme. Of these, 5.9 FTE (63%) are from the core group of BUC full-time staff. All the courses are taught by professors or associate professors. The BUC staff is responsible for the courses, although some are co-taught with part-time professors.

Of the 9.35 FTE allocated to the programme, 6.35 FTE (68%) are professors and 3.0 FTE (32%) are associate professors. If we only look at the core group of BUC full-time employees, 4.5 of 5.9 FTEs (76.2%) are professors. Hence, the condition is fulfilled.

#### Conclusion

Yes, the criteria and the demands specific to the cycle of the present educational provision are fulfilled.

### **4.3.3 The discipline community/-ies must be active in research and/or development work.**

c. For the third cycle, documented results at a high international level of quality, with satisfactory disciplinary breadth.

#### **Assessment**

All the members of the discipline community are active researchers at an international level, as indicated by having at least one publication in a peer-reviewed publication outlet in the last three years. While as expected most publications are at level 1 in the Norwegian quality system, several members of the core group also publish or have published in level 2 journals. This indicates that they have the necessary level not only to produce research at international level but also the potential to produce research in the forefront of their fields. High-level outlets published in by faculty members include Journal of Applied Psychology, Journal of Marketing and International Journal of Research in Marketing. In the extended group the level is even higher. In total, the committee believes that the research level of the discipline community is high enough to be able to provide education at the PhD level.

As noted in the application, the overall productivity at BUC is moderate and around the average or slightly lower than at comparable universities and university colleges. We note that the (currently) most productive researchers in the core discipline community are publishing outside marketing.

The impact of the research done by the discipline community is considerable as a whole, although this impact is highly unevenly distributed. Some researchers, particularly in the extended group, have a high impact as measured by the number of citations (Table 10 in the application). This is also the case for some of the faculty belonging to the core group. Uneven productivity and impact is common as well as present in any faculty group. As a whole the faculty group keeps the required international standard.

Looking at the range/breadth of topics we note that the research output of the discipline community is diverse and covers employee and user motivation, branding and brand management, business-to-business relationships, market orientation, tourism, consumer creativity and several other relevant areas to marketing. The breadth of the topics covered is sufficient to provide the necessary supervision and teaching.

#### **Conclusion**

Yes, the criteria and the demands specific to the cycle of the present educational provision are fulfilled.

### **4.3.4 The discipline community/-ies must participate actively in relevant national and international networks and collaborative arrangements/projects.**

#### **Assessment**

The members of the discipline community are actively engaging in national and international networks. All the members of the core group are publishing together with collaborators from other

institutions, and the faculty in the extended group naturally have their own networks and collaborators. It is the opinion of the committee that one of the strengths of the application is the strong ties with other faculty and institutions; formed through years of collaboration on the individual level and not for “strategic” reasons to fulfil the demands of the application process.

The networks are also strong to the local and national industry, in particular to the travel and tourism industry. This is witnessed through several previous and on-going projects in collaborations with firms and industries in this sector. The committee believes that the PhD programme will benefit from this, since it can give both funding (for instance through projects financed by the Norwegian Research Council and/or the industry), access to interesting research problems and relevant data.

The networks are also the bases for the agreements with the institutions with whom BUC has collaboration agreements, and where PhD students can go for shorter or longer visits. Thus, also the PhD students can benefit from the institution's international network.

#### Conclusion

Yes, the discipline community/-ies participates actively in relevant national and international networks and collaborative arrangements/projects.

#### **4.3.5 For provision with vocational practice/internship arrangements, the discipline community/-ies and the practice supervisors must have relevant experience from the practice field.**

Not applicable.

### ***4.4 Support functions and infrastructure***

#### **4.4.1 The institution must have rooms, library services, administrative and technical services, ICT resources and working conditions for their students that are satisfactory and adapted to the provision as described in the study plan and the number of enrolled students.**

##### Assessment

Current PhD students at BUC have their own individual offices. The committee notes that the master students at BUC, who have access to offices shared between four students, have better working conditions than many PhD students at other institutions. Since the institution is relatively small, there are short physical distances between students and between students and supervisors. A planned renovation project will also bring the office space up to date, and the committee is certain that BUC will be able to provide good physical working conditions even with an increase in the number of students.

The library facilities are adequate, and the library either has access to relevant scholarly articles through subscribed databases or is able to get the article from other collaborating libraries. The

availability of online databases of journals, arguably the most important issue for doctoral students, is good and in line with other institutions with PhD programmes in marketing or related subjects. Importantly, these journals are also available from outside the campus. The IT services are also adequate, and the students have access to the necessary software both for quantitative and qualitative analysis.

The administrative and support staff and functions are found adequate. One particularly important issue is support for both international PhD candidates coming to BUC to study and for PhD students spending part of the time abroad. These students typically have different needs than exchange students, since they need work permits, often bring their family, require other types of housing and so on. Based on the interviews with the administrative staff the committee believes that BUC has the necessary systems and resources to support these students.

### Conclusion

Yes, the institution has adequate support functions and infrastructure.

## 5 Conclusion

On the basis of the written application with attached documentation and the site visit, the expert committee concludes the following:

**The committee does not recommend accreditation of the PhD programme in Marketing Management at Buskerud University College.**

The committee concludes that the basic conditions for accreditation are fulfilled, that the discipline community attached to the programme is satisfactory, and that the support functions are satisfactory. The study plan does, however, not sufficiently fulfil the targeted learning outcomes, as described below. The committee therefore concludes that PhD program in marketing management in its current form does not meet the requirements.

The expert assessment states which demands the institution is required to meet in order to achieve accreditation. In addition, the committee has provided advice for the further development of this educational provision.

**The following demands are not met:**

### **4.2.2 The provision must be described with reference to learning outcomes**

**a. Learning outcomes must be expressed in terms of a candidate's intended achievements in knowledge, skills and general competence, as related to the National Qualifications Frameworks.**

- The institution must revise the knowledge related learning outcomes so they better match the level 8 in the Norwegian Qualification Framework.

**c. Content and design of the provision must be satisfactorily related to the description of learning outcomes.**

- The institution must revise the study plan to include compulsory courses in both quantitative and qualitative research methods.

**The committee offers the following advice to develop this educational provision further:**

The university college is advised to:

- Actively encourage recruitment also from outside the home institutions (Buskerud University College and Vestfold University College).
- Develop a “marketing” plan for active recruitment.



- Make sure that the method courses include exercise-based learning on those courses.
- Consider including other modes of assessment as well as a revision of the assessment scale.
- Require that the candidate is sole author on at least one article if the dissertation is article-based, and to include requirements regarding authorship in the supplements to the PhD regulations.
- Continue including PhD candidates in research projects.
- Not let the core group of marketing professors become smaller.
- Consider drafting a recruitment plan for the discipline community in order to make the programme less vulnerable.
- Consider recruiting more staff with competence in qualitative methods.
- Include the extended group as much as possible in the PhD programme, for instance in the annual seminar of PhD students.

## 6 Commentary from the institution

*Buskerud University College chose to write their comments in Norwegian (see below). Additionally they submitted a revised study plan (document number 13/383-17), which is written in English.*

Høgskolen i Buskerud vil takke komiteen og NOKUT for et hyggelig og konstruktivt institusjonsbesøk ved campus Ringerike 24. og 25. septmeber. Høyskolen vil videre takke den sakkyndige komiteen som har vurdert søknad om akkreditering av ph.d. i Marketing Management for den grundige rapporten, og for muligheten til å komme med kommentarer og forbedringer på de punktene komiteen fant ikke tilfredsstillende i sin rapport.

Komiteen konkluderer i sin rapport med at Høyskolen i Buskerud ikke tilfredsstillter kravene for akkreditering av ph.d. studium i Marketing Management. Høyskolen finner rapporten grundig og leser til tross for konklusjonen at komiteen langt på vei mener det omsøkte studiet holder tilstrekkelig kvalitet. Komiteen har pekt på to kriterier hvor komiteen mener høyskolen ikke tilfredsstillter de kravene som finnes i NOKUTs forskrift. Hva gjelder de resterende 14 kriteriene, så anser komiteen at høyskolen har tilfredsstillende kvalitet på disse. Nedenfor er det grundig redegjort for hvilke endringer høyskolen har gjort for å imøtekomme komiteens krav, og etter høyskolens oppfatning, endringer som forbedrer studieplanen ytterligere.

Komiteen har i tillegg valgt å komme med flere punkter til videre utvikling av studiet og fagmiljøet. Høyskolen takker komiteen for disse forslagene og tar disse med seg i den videre utviklingen av studiet. Noen av punktene til videre utvikling var av en slik karakter at høyskolen har valgt å kommentere disse i sitt tilsvaret til rapport, se nedenfor.

Høyskolens kommentarer til punktene komiteen mener ikke er tilfredsstillende:

Ad punkt 4.2.2a. Studiet skal beskrives med utgangspunkt i læringutbyttebeskrivelser. Komiteen skriver i sin konklusjon:

*«The institution must revise the knowledge- related learning outcomes so that they better match the level 8 in the Norwegian Qualifications Framework.»*

Høyskolen har hatt en ny gjennomgang av studieplanen med dette for øyet, og har gjort endringer både i de overordnede kunnskapsmålene og i kunnskapsmålene for hvert enkelt emne slik at disse er tilpasset de overordnede kunnskapsmålene, og er tilpasset nivå 8 (syklus 3) i det nasjonale kvalifikasjonsrammeverket. Komiteen har gjennom dialog med fagmiljøet under institusjonsbesøket, og i rapporten gitt uttrykk for at undervisnings- og evalueringsformer, samt pensum og opplegget for øvrig er på et tilfredsstillende nivå ift et phdstudium. Høyskolen har allikevel valgt å ta en helhetlig gjennomgang av studieplanen etter innspill fra komiteen. Dette med tanke på å sikre at helheten i studiet er kvalitetssikret og tilpasset nivå 8 (syklus 3). Nedenfor er de overordnede læringutbyttebeskrivelsene etter revisjon. Den reviderte studieplanen for ph.d. i Marketing Management er vedlagt i sin helhet (vedlegg 1).

### **Knowledge:**

1. Knowledge in the forefront of theories, methods, and specific issues pertaining to marketing management

2. Knowledge at high international standards of on-going research in the forefront of theory development in marketing management

3. Knowledge in the forefront of philosophy of science and relevant ethical issues relating to specific issues in marketing management research

**Skills:**

1. Ability to contribute to the development of new scientific knowledge, theories, and methods within the field of marketing management, to challenge the existing interpretations, and to use new forms of documentation to disseminate new knowledge within marketing management

2. Ability to formulate research problems and design relevant to marketing management and to carry out research at a high international academic level

3. Ability to evaluate the applicability of various research designs, methods, and data analyses specific to the field of marketing management

4. Ability to relate theories in marketing management to real-world marketing management issues and to apply research-based knowledge to challenge established practice in relevant organizations or businesses

5. Ability to evaluate the quality of others' research in the field of marketing management

**General competence:**

1. Ability to participate in academic discussions and communicate research work through recognized national and international academic channels in marketing management

2. Ability to contribute to innovation through dissemination and application of theories in marketing management to a broader audience outside academia, thereby enhancing knowledge and improving practice in marketing management

3. Ability to identify relevant ethical issues in marketing management and to work with the necessary professional integrity both in and outside the academic field of marketing management

4. Development of transferable skills to manage complex projects fitted for assignments both in research and the practice field of marketing management

Ad punkt 2.4.4.c. Studiets innhold og oppbygning skal tilfredsstillende relateres til læringsutbyttet slik dette er beskrevet i planen. Komiteen skriver i sin konklusjon.

*«The institution is required to revise the study plan so that it includes compulsory courses in quantitative and qualitative research methods.»*

Høgskolen har revidert studieplanen i tråd med innspillene fra komiteen, slik at kurset i kvalitative metoder nå er gjort obligatorisk. Stipendiatene skal nå både gjennomgå obligatoriske emner i kvalitativ og kvantitative metoder på til sammen 22,5 poeng (7,5 poeng i kvalitative metoder og 15 poeng i kvantitative metoder). Høgskolen vil for øvrig påpeke at kurset i kvalitative metoder fremdeles

er planlagt gjennomført med samlinger, slik at det er egnet til å inngå i porteføljen til The National Research School in Business, Economics and Administration. Videre vil vi påpeke at studentene fremdeles kan ta valgfrie emner fra nasjonale og internasjonale samarbeidspartnere som er tilpasset den enkeltes tema for det avsluttende forskningsarbeidet. Endringene er synliggjort i vedlagte reviderte studieplan for ph.d. i Marketing Management (vedlegg 1).

Nedenfor følger høyskolen sine kommentarer til noen av punktene til videre utvikling.

Ad punkt 4.1.3 Det skal redegjøres for forventet studentrekruttering i forhold til å etablere og opprettholde et tilfredsstillende læringsmiljø og i forhold til stabilitet i studiet. Komiteen råder høyskolen til følgende:

- Actively encourage recruitment also from outside the home institutions
- Develop a “marketing” plan for active recruitment

Høgskolen i Buskerud er klar over de utfordringene som gjelder når det kommer til å rekruttere studenter til en ph.d. utdanning. Dette var også tema da komiteen var på institusjonsbesøk i september, og møtte både faglig ledelse og fagpersonalet. Ansvarlig professor for studiet vil sammen med dekan og programstyret lage en langsiktig rekrutteringsplan for å få tilstrekkelig antall stipendiater til studiet. Planen vil inneholde strategier for å rekruttere internt så vel som nasjonalt og internasjonalt. Tiltakene for rekruttering, slik disse er tenkt pr nå er samlet i følgende punkter:

- Programansvarlig vil ha som en av sine viktigste oppgaver å drive aktiv rekruttering av stipendiater, spesielt eksternt
- Veiledere på høyskolens masterstudium vil aktivt motivere og rekruttere studenter som utmerker seg, til å søke ph.d.- studiet. Dette vil skje ved at de som er kursansvarlige og veiledere fanger opp masterstudenter som er spesielt opptatt av en forskningstilnærming. Disse studentene vil kunne inngå i forskersteam gjennom andre år i masterstudiet.
- Aktivt bruke fagpersoner og stipendiater til å gjennomføre besøk og drive rekruttering ved relevante nasjonale høyskoler og universiteter (private og offentlige) med masterstudier innen marketing og oppfordre konkrete personer til å søke
- Bekjentgjøre ledige ph.d.- stillinger innenfor faglige nettverk nasjonalt og internasjonalt, med særlig focus på samarbeidsinstitusjoner nasjonalt og internasjonalt, professor II- stillinger skal som en del av tilsetningsforholdet kunne bidra til rekrutteringen
- Bekjentgjøre ledige ph.d.- stillinger gjennom bl.a. studentaviser og sosiale medier
- Gjennomføre besøk ved og drive aktiv rekruttering i forhold til næringsliv og offentlig virksomhet med tanke på nærings- ph.d og tilsvarende ordning for offentlig sektor jfr tilleggsproposisjonen for Statsbudsjettet 2014
- Utvikle eksternt finansierte forskningsprosjekter (NFR og EU) med stipendiatstillinger som en del av prosjektet, disse kan sees på som en forlengelse av aktuelle masterprosjekter og rekruttering vil foregå fra masterstudiene.

Ad punkt 4.2.2e. Eksamens- og vurderingsordninger skal være egnet til å vurdere i hvilken grad studenten har oppnådd læringsutbyttet. Komiteen råder høyskolen til følgende:

*«require that the candidate is sole author on at least one article if the dissertation is article- based, and to include requirements regarding authorship in the supplements to the PhD regulations”*

Høyskolen mener dette er et godt innspill, og har valgt å legge det inn som premiss at stipendiaten skal være eneforfatter på minst en artikkel. Dette er foreløpig lagt inn i studieplanen og vil tas inn som en del av tillegget til forskriften ved en senere revidering av denne.

Ad punkt 4.3.1 Fagmiljøets sammensetning, størrelse og samlede kompetanse skal være tilpasset studiet slik det er beskrevet i plan for studiet og samtidig tilstrekkelig for å ivareta den forskning og det faglige eller kunstneriske utviklingsarbeidet som utføres. Komiteen råder høyskolen til følgende:

- *Not let the core group of marketing professors become smaller*
- *Consider drafting a recruitment plan for the discipline community in order to make the programme less vulnerable*
- *Consider recruiting more staff with competence in qualitative methods*
- *Include the extended group as much as possible in the PhD programme, for instance in the annual seminar for PhD students*

Høgskolen i Buskerud har over tid drevet systematisk oppbygging og styrking av fagmiljøet innen kjerneområdene for søknaden. For å sikre kvalitet og forskning i den internasjonale forskningsfronten har vi ytterligere planer om styrking av den faglige egenkapital. Ifm fusjonen med Høgskolen i Vestfold vil staben styrkes faglig, både i forhold til undervisning og forskning – utover de konkret personer fra Høgskolen i Vestfold som er angitt i søknaden.

Tiltakene framover er samlet i følgende punkter:

- Tilsetting av to nye professorer innen kjernen av Marketing Management.
- Tilrettelegging for intern kompetanseheving til professorkompetanse for to ansatte.
- Tre ansatte innen fagområdet jobber med tanke på opprykk til førsteamanuensis.
- Samarbeidsopplegg med ulike partnerinstitusjoner med tanke på ansattutveksling for å bygge opp tettere forskningssamarbeid som også inkluderer våre ph.d.-studenter.
- Tilsetting av en ny professor II fra samarbeidende institusjon i Canada.
- Erstatning av eventuelt ansatt som slutter, det er for tiden ikke kjent at noen av våre ansatte planlegger å slutte.

For å stimulere til et attraktivt fagmiljø for både ansatte og studenter vil det avsettes ressurser til:

- Datainnsamling (kjøp av survey- data og etablering av testlab innenfor f.eks Consumer Behavior og eksperimentell økonomi)

- Reisebudsjett og konferansedeltagelse
- Bruk av gjesteforelesere, og tilrettelegge for at utenlandske professorer kan ta sabbat ved Høgskolen i Buskerud
- Sabbatsordninger for egne ansatte

For øvrig tar høyskolen komiteens øvrige forslag til videre utvikling med seg i arbeidet med å stadig kvalitetsutvikle studiet.

Høgskolen i Buskerud anser å ha imøtekommet komiteens kritiske punkter og ser fram til den videre prosessen.

## 7 The expert committee's additional evaluation

The committee has studied Buskerud University College's comments to our assessment and the revised study plan. We are impressed with the effort and dedication BUC has put into the revision to enhance the quality of its planned PhD Program in Marketing Management.

We now conclude as follows:

### 4.2.2. a) The provision must be described with reference to learning outcomes.

Learning outcomes must be expressed in terms of a candidate's intended achievements in knowledge, skills and general competence, as related to the National Qualifications Framework.

The learning outcomes related to knowledge, skills and general competence have been revised to satisfy the level 8 requirement (cycle 3) both for the study plan and for each of the included subjects. How the learning outcomes have been revised so as to indicate the PhD level, can be illustrated by the first bullet point in the category of knowledge. In the application, this was formulated in this way:

- *In-depth knowledge* of theories, methods, and specific issues pertaining to marketing management

"In-depth knowledge" is an expression which is associated with lower levels in the National Qualification Framework. Because the learning outcomes consistently indicated a lower level both in the description of the program as a whole and the different subjects, the committee found them not to be satisfactory for a PhD programme.

In the revised version of the learning outcomes, this point has been rephrased in the following way:

- *Knowledge in the forefront* of theories, methods, and specific issues pertaining to marketing management

"Knowledge in the forefront" is an expression used in the National Qualification Framework for level 8 (PhD) and is a clear indicator of the level of this qualification.

Conclusion:

Yes, the stated learning outcomes are adequate and satisfy the level 8 requirement in the National Qualifications Framework.

### 4.2.2. c) Content and design of the provision must be satisfactorily related to the description of learning outcomes.

The study plan has now been changed to include mandatory courses in both quantitative and qualitative courses. The study plan is now satisfactory.

Conclusion:

Yes, the content and design of the provision is satisfactorily related to the description of learning outcomes.

## **8 Final conclusion**

On the basis of the commentary and the revised study plan as well as the site visit, the expert committee's final conclusion is:

**The committee now recommends accreditation of the PhD program in Marketing Management at Buskerud University College.**



## 9 Decision

Ph.d.-studium i markedsføringsledelse ved Høgskolen i Buskerud tilfredsstiller kravene til akkreditering slik de er utformet i NOKUTs forskrift om tilsyn med utdanningskvaliteten i høyere utdanning (tilsynsforskriften), kapittel 4 Akkreditering av studier, §§ 4.1 – 4.4, vedtatt av NOKUTs styre 27. januar 2011.

Ph.d.-studium i markedsføringsledelse akkrediteres.

## 10 Presentation of the expert committee

### **Professor Emeritus Kjell Grønhaug, Norwegian School of Economics (committee leader)**

Kjell Grønhaug is professor emeritus at the Department of Strategy and Management at the Norwegian School of Economics (NHH). He started as an associate professor in marketing at the same institution in 1973. Grønhaug has his education within economics and completed his Licentiate of Science degree at NHH in 1971. He also has a postgraduate degree in sociology. He has through his long career taught and undertaken research within areas such as marketing management, marketing strategy, research methods and the theory of science. As a researcher he has achieved many distinctions; he has been awarded honorary doctorates at several schools of economics in Sweden and Finland as well as NHH's honorary award for outstanding research in 2001. Especially emphasised at such occasions is the great span of his research. Grønhaug has through several years held a special responsibility for the PhD programme at the Department of Strategy and Management. He also led "Forskerakademiet", the organisation that coordinated the doctoral education when NHH only was entitled to give the PhD degree in economics.

### **Professor Niina Nummela, Turku School of Economics**

Niina Nummela is professor in international business at Turku School of Economics. She has the Licentiate of Science degree in economics and business administration with international marketing as her major, and a PhD degree in international business. After completing her doctoral degree at Turku School of Economics, she was employed by the same institution – first as a researcher, later as associate professor and from 1998 as professor. She led what was then the Department of Marketing through several years. At present, she is involved in multiple research projects in areas such as value creation in international growth and international entrepreneurial firms. All the projects are carried out in close cooperation with both firms and academic partners in and outside of Finland. In 2010 she was named "Researcher of the year" at Turku School of Economics. Nummela was part of the faculty when the international marketing programme was named a national centre of excellence in teaching in 1997-1998. These days she supervises many PhD candidates and master students. Under the supervision of Nummela 11 PhD candidates have so far completed their doctoral degrees and 130 master students have submitted their master theses.

### **Professor Terje I. Våland, University of Stavanger**

Terje I. Våland is professor in strategy and industrial marketing at the University of Stavanger. Våland has a master degree in management and a PhD in marketing (dr.oecon). Previously Våland has been at the Norwegian Business School (BI) and the Royal Norwegian Naval Academy, and he has taught subjects such as marketing, supply chain management/logistics and strategy. In addition to the Norwegian institutions, he has experience from stays abroad and corporate schools. Våland has participated in doctoral assessment committees and in drafting an application for a PhD programme. At present he supervises two PhD candidates. In addition to his position at the University of Stavanger, Våland is also an independent consultant in industrial marketing, management and strategy.

## **PhD candidate Jakob Utgård, the Norwegian Business School (BI)**

Jakob Utgård has been a PhD candidate at the Department of Marketing at the Norwegian Business School (BI) since September 1<sup>st</sup> 2009. He holds a bachelor degree in marketing from BI (2003) and a Master of Science in Business and Society from the University of Bath, UK (2004). Before his engagement as a PhD candidate, he worked as product manager in Nidar AS, and as an advisor and researcher at the Norwegian Agricultural Economics Research Institute. The subject of his PhD dissertation is corporate social responsibility and social results in retail trade. In three articles he investigates the drivers behind the sale of alcohol to minors in convenience stores, the drivers of communication of corporate social responsibility among retail chains and the connection between competition and food hygiene in convenience stores. In addition to the subject of his dissertation, he also has research interests in brand relations and the effect of negative events on brands.

## **11 Documentation<sup>5</sup>**

13/383-1: Høgskolen i Buskerud - søknad om akkreditering av ph.d.-studium i markedsføringsledelse

13/383-11: Supplering av søknad - Høgskolen i Buskerud - søknad om akkreditering av ph.d.-studium i markedsføringsledelse

13/383-12: Oversikt over engelskspråklige kurs - Høgskolen i Buskerud - søknad om akkreditering av ph.d.-studium i markedsføringsledelse

13/383-17: Kommentarer til sakkyndig rapport - Høgskolen i Buskerud - søknad om akkreditering av ph.d.-studium i markedsføringsledelse

---

<sup>5</sup> Most of the documentation is in English, even if the titles of the documents are in Norwegian.